



Warehouse Management System Vendor Research and Evaluation

Project Sponsor

American Girl

Authors

**Ryley O'Brien
Prasanna Akella
Marion Baldy
Fang-Hsiu Liu**

December 2010

Executive Summary

Over the years, American Girl has evolved from being a direct marketer to a multi-channel retailer. The company's current warehouse management system (WMS) is several years old, and not able to fully support the growing needs and increasing complexities of distribution center operations. As a result, American Girl is considering replacing its WMS system. The objective of our student-team project is, therefore, to assist American Girl in the research, evaluation, and selection of WMS vendors that will best meet their business requirements moving forward.

We will deliver to American Girl a detailed RFI, four vendor responses to the RFI, a score sheet by which all the RFI's can be weighted and scored and also comments and suggestions from other companies who are in the process of, or have recently installed, a WMS system regarding their experiences with WMS evaluation and vendor selection.

These deliverables will be met by constructing an RFI specifically tailored to American Girl's specific WMS requirements, analyzing the RFI's obtained from four chosen vendors both quantitatively and qualitatively, interviewing UW-EBC companies and offering our suggestions and conclusions based off our analysis.

Based on the vendor responses to the RFI and the extent to which they meet American Girl's requirements, Manhattan Associates scored the best, followed closely by RedPrairie and Sterling Commerce, and with Oracle coming in a distant last. It is suggested that, as a next step of the evaluation, American Girl have the vendors perform detailed WMS product demonstrations of specific scripted company requirements. In addition to the functional requirements, it is also important for American Girl to evaluate several practical aspects of the implementation and the relationship with the vendor. For instance, it is important to understand if there will be 3rd party vendors involved, and if so, to understand the language of the agreements between the primary vendor, yourself, and the 3rd party vendor. This will ensure proper accountability in project implementation, and help mitigate risk.

Acknowledgements

Our project team would like to take this opportunity to thank the following individuals who invested the time and energy to make this project happen. Their helpful insight and knowledge of the project deliverables were key to a successful project. We greatly appreciate their help and recognize that they are part of the reason that we completed this project successfully.

Jeff Freeman, Sr. Vice President, Operations

James Wooten, Sr. Manager, Operations & Retail Systems

Kevin DeLorme, Business Analyst, Operations Systems

Barb Campana, Manager, Outbound

Jeff Van Horn, Manager, Fulfillment Services

Joe Norris, Supervisor, Inventory Control

Nelson Marks, Technical Analyst

Additionally, we would like to thank Professor Dharmaraj Veeramani; this project was successful thanks in part to his knowledge and help in the project methodology, project presentation, and also his help with the final report.

Thank you all,

Ryley O'Brien
Prasanna Akella
Marion Baldy
Fang-Hsiu Liu

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	2
Acknowledgements	3
1. Introduction	6
1.1 Company Background.....	6
1.2 Motivation.....	6
1.3 Goals and Objectives	6
1.4 Project Deliverables.....	7
2. Project Methodology	7
2.1 Project Methodology.....	7
2.1.1 Gather and Confirm Requirements	8
2.1.2 Additional Research about WMS	8
2.1.3 Development of RFI	8
2.1.4 Analysis of RFI.....	10
2.1.5 Insights from UW – EBC Members	10
2.1.6 Summary and Recommendations	10
2.2 RFI Vendor Selection	10
2.2.1 Gartner Report	11
2.2.2 Vendor Landscape	12
3. Vendor Analysis.....	14
3.1 Overview.....	14
3.2 Vendor Business Overview.....	14
3.3 Capability Analysis.....	16
3.3.1 Receiving	16
3.3.2 Put away	19
3.3.3 Quality and Inventory Control.....	21
3.3.4 Picking D2C	24
3.3.5 Picking B2B.....	26
3.3.6 Picking-Retail Replenishment	27
3.3.7 Picking – Shop Orders	30
3.3.8 Picking-Planning	32
3.3.9 Monitor Wave.....	34
3.3.10 Pick Option	35
3.3.11 Picking Approach	36
3.3.12 Picking Sequence.....	38
3.3.13 Packing/Shipping.....	39
3.3.14 Others.....	44
3.3.15 Architecture	50
3.3.16 Software Architecture	51
3.3.17 Security	54
3.3.18 Configuration Requirements.....	57
3.3.19 Reports.....	60
3.3.20 Interface Requirements / User Interface	63
3.3.21 Host Interface	67
3.3.22 Production Support.....	69
3.3.23 Comparison.....	70
4. UW E-Business Consortium Company Interviews	70
4.1 Purpose.....	70
4.2 Methodology and Questions	70

5. Summary and Recommendations..... 71
Appendix A - Initial American Girl WMS Requirements..... 72
Appendix B – American Girl RFI Template 78
Appendix C – Completed Sterling Commerce RFI..... 95
Appendix D – Completed Manhattan Associates RFI..... 116
Appendix E – Completed RedPrairie RFI..... 177
Appendix F – Completed Oracle RFI..... 242